

CARSI Replication Results: Table 2



Results from Published Models and De-identified Models

- The original models described in the published report employed a multi-level model that required the use of community level indicators for random effects. Given that the interviews covered such a small area (i.e, neighborhoods) and given the extremely sensitive of the information (reports on crime, gangs, threats, extortion, etc.) included in the questionnaire in the context of highly violent countries and regions, our obligation to protect the anonymity of respondents is especially high. For this reason, we have removed all indicators below the level of the municipio. Therefore, it is not possible to replicate the exact models in the published analysis. However, we have re-analyzed all the data using a simplified model (a regression without controls and without random or fixed effects) and find very similar results, leading to the same conclusions. As a courtesy to users, we provide these figures and models alongside the original published models for comparison.

Replication of Table 2. LAPOP Impact Evaluation: Summary Results by Region and Country; Trends and Percentages Change Attributable to the Community-based Crime Prevention Program (page 31)

[Numbers in red are a percent decrease, number in green are a percent increase. All effects are significant unless noted with "ns".]

Variables	Without Panama	With Panama	ELS	GUA	HON
Reported ROBBERIES (Published Model)	30	19	25	27	35
Reported ROBBERIES (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	29	19	26	19	26
Reported SALE OF ILLEGAL DRUGS (Published Model)	35	25	36	50	37
Reported SALE OF ILLEGAL DRUGS (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	34	27	34	36	34
Reported EXTORTION (Published Model)	48	51	52	43	57
Reported EXTORTION (Replicated Model Without Identifiers)	43	43	50	24	50
Reported MURDERS (Published Model)	50	51	40	60	43
Reported MURDERS (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	47	48	44	41	44
PERCEPTION OF INSECURITY					
Perception of insecurity (Published Model)	9	5	17	22	ns
Perception of insecurity (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	9	4	17	17	17
Perception of insecurity when walking alone at night (Published Model)	16	11	13	13	15
Perception of insecurity when walking alone at night (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	14	10	13	12	13
NEIGHBORHOOD DISORDER (INCLUDING YOUTH VULNERABILITY TO CRIME AND GANG ACTIVITY)					
Young people hanging out on the streets (Published Model)	6	8	8	10	ns
Young people hanging out on the streets (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	4	9	8	10	8
Young people who are in gangs as a problem (Published Model)	14	14	14	17	17
Young people who are in gangs as a problem (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	13	14	14	16	14
Gang fights as a problem (Published Model)	10	13	12	15	19

Variables	Without Panama	With Panama	ELS	GUA	HON
Gang fights as a problem (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	10	13	12	13	12
SOCIAL CONTROL					
Avoid walking through dangerous areas (Published Model)	37	35	40	13	36
Avoid walking through dangerous areas (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	35	34	42	ns	42
Community is organized to prevent crime (Published Model)	26	18	18	16	ns
Community is organized to prevent crime (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	23	16	18	14	18
ROLE OF INSTITUTIONS: THE POLICE					
Trust in the National Police (Published Model)	10	9	ns	21	ns
Trust in the National Police (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	9	8	ns	20	ns
Satisfaction with Police Performance (Published Model)	11	5	11	19	ns
Satisfaction with Police Performance (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	11	4	12	17	12
INDIRECT EFFECTS: DEMOCRATIC VALUES					
Interpersonal Trust (Published Model)	ns	3	11	6	2
Interpersonal Trust (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	6	3	13	7	13
Satisfaction with Democracy (Published Model)	16	7	8	15	20
Satisfaction with Democracy (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	16	7	9	15	9
Evaluation of government handling security (Published Model)	ns	ns	8	<u>-7*</u>	ns
Evaluation of government handling security (Replicated Model without Identifiers)	ns	ns	9	<u>-7*</u>	9

* These effects are significant, but in the opposite direction expected